XAVIER BECERRA Attorney General

State of California DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE



1300 I STREET, SUITE 125 P.O. BOX 944255 SACRAMENTO, CA 94244-2550

Public: (916) 445-9555 Telephone: (916) 210-7765 Facsimile: (916) 324-2960 E-Mail: <u>Caely.Fallini@doj.ca.gov</u>

State Bar No. 258859

February 27, 2018

Jorge E. Navarrete Court Administrator and Clerk of the Supreme Court Earl Warren Building 350 McAllister Street San Francisco, CA 94102-4797

RE: People v. Charles E. Case

Case No. S057156

Dear Mr. Navarrete:

As a result of further examination of the issues in preparation for oral argument, respondent has reconsidered its position in Argument I, appellant's claim that his statements were admitted in violation of *Miranda v. Arizona* (1966) 384 U.S. 436. It is still respondent's position that appellant's invocation of his right to silence was limited to the robbery/murder at The Office bar. (See RB 59-64.) However, respondent now acknowledges that the police violated this limited invocation by asking appellant the following: "Oh, you were [at The Office bar] with your girlfriend?" (Aug. CT of 11/10/09 "Appendix A" at p. 4, line 8.)

Consequently, appellant's subsequent statements discussing the time he arrived at the bar (Aug. CT of 11/10/09 "Appendix A" at p. 4, lines 8-14; 21RT 7253); seeing coverage of the murder on television (Aug. CT of 11/10/09 "Appendix A" at p. 4, line 28 through p. 5, lines 1-2; 21RT 7252); the times at which he took Sue Burlingame home and returned to the bar (Aug. CT of 11/10/09 "Appendix A" at p. 5, lines 13-18; 21RT 7253); the length of time he stayed at the bar (Aug. CT of 11/10/09 "Appendix A" at p. 5, lines 22-28; 21RT 7254); playing pool at the bar by himself (Aug. CT of 11/10/09 "Appendix A" at p. 7, lines 5-9; 21RT 7254); the "barmaid" announcing she would close the bar at 9:00 p.m. (Aug. CT of 11/10/09 "Appendix A" at p. 7, lines 15-19; 21RT 7254-7255); the vehicle he drove to the bar and the place where he parked that vehicle (Aug. CT of 11/10/09 "Appendix A" at p. 7, lines 1-6; 21RT 7255); his clothing (Aug. CT of 11/10/09 "Appendix A" at p. 11, lines 14-21; 21RT 7255-7256);

and his shaving injury (Aug. CT of 11/10/09 "Appendix A" at p. 18, lines 24-28 through p. 19 lines 1-11; 21RT 7256-7257) were inadmissible. However, for the reasons set forth in Respondent's Brief, the error was harmless. (See RB 73-78.)

Sincerely,

/S/ Caely E. Fallini

CAELY E. FALLINI Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 258859

For XAVIER BECERRA Attorney General

DECLARATION OF ELECTRONIC SERVICE AND SERVICE BY U.S. MAIL

Case Name: **People v. Case**

No.: **S057156**

I declare:

I am employed in the Office of the Attorney General, which is the office of a member of the California State Bar, at which member's direction this service is made. I am 18 years of age or older and not a party to this matter. I am familiar with the business practice at the Office of the Attorney General for collecting and processing electronic and physical correspondence. In accordance with that practice, correspondence placed in the internal mail collection system at the Office of the Attorney General is deposited with the United States Postal Service with postage thereon fully prepaid that same day in the ordinary course of business. Correspondence that is submitted electronically is transmitted using the TrueFiling electronic filing system. Participants who are registered with TrueFiling will be served electronically. Participants in this case who are not registered with TrueFiling will receive hard copies of said correspondence through the mail via the United States Postal Service or a commercial carrier.

On <u>February 27, 2018</u>, I electronically served the attached **Reconsideration Letter to Clerk** by transmitting a true copy via this Court's TrueFiling system. Because one or more of the participants in this case have not registered with the Court's TrueFiling system or are unable to receive electronic correspondence, on <u>February 27, 2018</u>, I placed a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope in the internal mail collection system at the Office of the Attorney General at 1300 I Street, Suite 125, P.O. Box 944255, Sacramento, CA 94244-2550, addressed as follows:

Robin Kallman
Deputy State Public Defender
221 Main Street, 10th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94105
Counsel for Appellant Charles E. Case

The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814

Hayes H. Gable, III Attorney at Law 1001 G Street, Suite 100 Sacramento, CA 95814 Stacy R. Bogh 2617 K Street, Suite 225 Sacramento, CA 95816

Sacramento County Counsel's Office 700 H Street, Suite 2650 Sacramento, CA 95814

California Appellate Project (SF) 101 Second Street, Suite 600 San Francisco, CA 94105-3647

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on February 27, 2018, at Sacramento, California.

/S/ B.Thalken

Signature

SA1996XS0012 33295987.docx

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Supreme Court of California

PROOF OF SERVICE

STATE OF CALIFORNIASupreme Court of California

Case Name: PEOPLE v. CASE (CHARLES EDWARD)

Case Number: **S057156**

Lower Court Case Number:

- 1. At the time of service I was at least 18 years of age and not a party to this legal action.
- 2. My email address used to e-serve: Caely.Fallini@doj.ca.gov
- 3. I served by email a copy of the following document(s) indicated below:

Title(s) of papers e-served:

Filing Type	Document Title
LETTER	Case Reconsideration Letter to Clerk

Service Recipients:

Person Served	Email Address	Type	Date / Time
Office Of The State Public Defender - Ok Robin Kallman, Deputy State Public Defender SFD	docketing@opsd.ca.gov	e- Service	2/27/2018 2:55:51 PM
Office Of The State Public Defender - Ok Robin Kallman, Deputy State Public Defender SFD	kallman@ospd.ca.gov	e- Service	2/27/2018 2:55:51 PM
Office Of The State Public Defender - Ok Robin Kallman, Deputy State Public Defender SFD	robin.kallman@ospd.ca.gov	e- Service	2/27/2018 2:55:51 PM
AG-AWT Sac/Fresno E-Service DOJ Sacramento/Fresno AWT Crim AG-00001	sacawttruefiling@doj.ca.gov	1	2/27/2018 2:55:51 PM
Caely Fallini DOJ Sacramento/Fresno AWT Crim 258859	Caely.Fallini@doj.ca.gov	e- Service	2/27/2018 2:55:51 PM
OSPD Docketing Office of the State Public Defender 000000	docketing@ospd.ca.gov	e- Service	2/27/2018 2:55:51 PM
Robin Kallman Office of the State Public Defender 118639	robin.kallman@ospd.ca.gov	e- Service	2/27/2018 2:55:51 PM

This proof of service was automatically created, submitted and signed on my behalf through my agreements with TrueFiling and its contents are true to the best of my information, knowledge, and belief.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

--

/s/Caely Fallini	
Signature	
Fallini, Caely (258859)	
Last Name, First Name (PNum)	

DOJ Sacramento/Fresno AWT Crim

Law Firm

Date